

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN  
SOUTHERN DIVISION

CHRISTIE TOTH, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

EDWARD CALLAGHAN, et al.,

Defendants.

---

Case No. 12-CV-11700

HON. MARK A. GOLDSMITH

**JUDGMENT**

For the reasons stated in the Opinion and Order entered on today's date, it is ordered and adjudged that PA 45 was enacted in violation of Article IV, § 24 of the Michigan Constitution and is, therefore, invalid and unenforceable. Judgment is entered in favor of initiating Plaintiffs and Intervenor and against Defendants.

Dated: February 5, 2014  
Flint, Michigan

s/Mark A. Goldsmith  
MARK A. GOLDSMITH  
United States District Judge

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned certifies that the foregoing document was served upon counsel of record and any unrepresented parties via the Court's ECF System to their respective email or First Class U.S. mail addresses disclosed on the Notice of Electronic Filing on February 5, 2014.

s/Deborah J. Goltz  
DEBORAH J. GOLTZ  
Case Manager